



## R E V I E W

for: the dissertation on acquisition of PhD degree (bulg. doctor), in Professional field (PF) 2.2 History and archaeology, in Doctoral program (DP) Ancient history and Thracology at Institute for Balkan Studies & Center of Thracology (IBCT) of the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences (BAS), of the regular doctoral student Stefan Yanakiev, entitled The Thracians and the Roman provincial society between Istros fluvius and Haemus mons in 1st – 3rd c.

prepared by: Prof. Dr. hab. Rumen Teofilov Ivanov – Archaeological Institute with Museum, based on the Order of the Director of IBCT Prof. Dr. Romyana Preshlenova for SJ № 66 RD-10 / 11.06.2021 and Protocol № 01 / 21.06.2021 of the first meeting of SJ.

### **Brief biographical data about the candidate.**

Mr. Stefan Yanakiev graduated from Plovdiv University "Paisii Hilendarski" as a bachelor in "Archaeology and History" (2016), and the following year (2017) a master's degree in "Archaeology and Archaeological Cultural Heritage". Since January 2018 he is a full-time doctoral student at the Center of Thracology of IBCT at BAS, with a dissertation on the Thracians and the Roman provincial society between Istros fluvius and Haemus mons in the 1st – 3rd c.AD and term of study: 01. 01. 2018 - 31. 12 2020. Here he successfully performs and re-fulfills the tasks set in the Individual Plan, participates in conferences and projects of the Institute. There are 4 articles written: 3 published and 1 under print, upon request of 3 articles, according to art. 9 (2) of the Annex to the Regulations of the Scientific Council of IBCT regarding the terms and conditions for acquiring scientific degrees and holding academic positions. The doctoral student meets the minimum national requirements for "doctor" (PhD) in the field of Humanities by group of indicators, gaining 90 points (Group A = 50 + Group D = 40), from the required minimum of 80 points: from Group A - 50 + from Group D - 30, according to the Regulations of BAS for application of Law for development of the academic staff in the Republic of Bulgaria (LDASRB, Bulg. abbreviation ZRASRB) and according to the requirement of art. 9 (2) of the Annex to the Regulations of the Scientific Council of IBCT.

### **Characteristics of scientific production.**

According to Art. 27, (2) of the Regulations for application of LDASRB (Bulg. abbreviation ZRASRB) the dissertation consists of: title

page; content; introduction; exposition; conclusion - summary of the obtained results; declaration of originality; bibliography.

After the title page and the declaration of originality, which is at the beginning, the content of the paper consists of: introduction = Introduction, exposition = four chapters, Conclusion – summary of the results, Scientific contributions to the dissertation, bibliography = References. A total of 512 pages, of which 455 pages of text.

### **THE TITLE:**

The chronological range is I-III century AD. However, on page 9 it says: “The chronological framework includes the period from the beginning of the 1st century, running during the years of the reign of the Roman emperors from the Julius-Claudius dynasty to the last quarter of the 3rd century (around 270/275), when marks the beginning of a new provincial system in the Balkan Thracian lands, and also changes in the governing form of the Empire itself, the so-called. second period of its development - Dominate. ". It was better to use the term Principate, ie. from the time of Augustus to Diocletian. The following structure is accepted - Principate - Tetrarchy (with two phases in Diocletian) – Dominate/Late Antiquity (from Constantine I onwards). It was better to use the term Principle, ie. from the time of Augustus to Diocletian. The doctoral student stopped at Aurelian when, after 271, the evacuation of the Dacian lands (*provincia trium Daciarum*) began. So far, the earliest inscription mentioning Dacia Aureliana, Dacia Nova is from 282. The organization of the new provinces south of the Danube has not become the same and not in the same way. (T. Sarnowski. *Die Legio I Italica und der untere Donauabschnitt der Notitia Dignitatum.*- *Germania* 63, № 1, 1985: 107-127). For example, the first province from west to east is Dacia Ripensis (Coastal Dacia), formed by parts of the former Upper and Lower Moesia. It also borders the new province of Moesia Secunda (Second Moesia, with territories taken entirely from Lower Moesia). For its part, it has Scythia as its neighbor (the former region of Little Scythia, also completed with lands from Lower Moesia;). and this happened between July 21, 286, and March 1, 293 (Zahariade, M.1988: 32 sqq., 187; Ivanov, R. 1999: 27-28 and cited there literature.). (recently I found out t The following structure is usually accepted - Principate - Tetrarchy (with two phases in Diocletian) - Dominant (from Constantine I onwards). Shortly afterwards, the doctoral student explained that it would start from the time of Burebista, who ruled territories beyond the great European river. hat there is a new monument from there with a more accurate date - non vidi).

**INTRODUCTION** (5-32 p.) Contains 7 paragraphs: 1. Aims and objectives of the work clearly states that the aim is to determine the role and importance of the Thracian population in the development of Roman provincial society in the territory between Istros fluvius and Haemus mons in I - III century AD, from which arise 5 tasks, arguably related to the assessment and the way of working with written sources and epigraphic monuments, the discovery of the Thracians in the administrative, cult and military structures of Roman provincialism; Pristaroplaninska; 3. Chronological boundaries of the study are justified by the political development of the Roman Empire during its first period - the Principle; 4. Research methods presents prosopographic and anthroponymic analysis of literary and epigraphic monuments containing data about Thracians (mainly in the army, administration, cult colleges), and for more convincing argumentation the texts are included in the exposition (chronologically and territorially - according to the three areas ); 5. An overview of the source base of the study briefly provides data on the main types of sources: written (with criticism of ancient authors) and especially epigraphic; ; 6. Status of the research analytically presents the main research in this thematic circle; 7. Terminology informs us what is understood and in what aspect basic working terms such as daco-moesi and romanism / romanization are used in the work.

It should be noted that the Danubius / Danuvius River can be considered as a constant factor with one small exception. This is the end of the Second Dacian War - after August, 106 until the beginning of Hadrian's reign - around 122-123, when territories north of the Danube were temporarily under the control of the Lower Moesian governor. In addition, the Limes west of Novae (the east part of Svishtov) – Dimum (Belene). The minimum no longer exists, because north of the Danube there is already a new province - Dacia Inferior (Lower Dacia).

I agree with the dissertation that Michal Duch's ideas about the spread of Lower Moesia in the direction of the Carpathians and Moldova should be considered rather hypothetical with uncertain data on the governor's jurisdiction. Moreover, the Romanian colleagues Nicolae Gudia and Mihail Zahariade assume that Lower Moesia has as many as 5 limes zones (!? - the signs are mine). The first of them covers the Danube to the delta and then continues along the northern Black Sea coast and Crimea (M. Zahariade, N. Gudea. *The Fortifications of Lower Moesia (A.D.86-275)*. Amsterdam 1997). Besides them, some Ukrainian historians support this opinion, e.g. Alexey Martemyanov). Rather, it is a more permanent military occupation, which does not have the characteristics of the northeastern part of the province of Lower Moesia. Regarding the southern border, the author advocates different opinions on page 240.

Stara Planina mountain has been the border between the northern and southern provinces since the end of the third century. Because emporium Discoduraterae near the village of Gostilitsa, Gabrovo region in Northern Bulgaria belongs to/after Aurelian to the territory of Augusta Traiana (Stara Zagora) in the province of Thrace. The northern part of the Serdica territory is located on the other side and north of the ridge of the Balkans (it includes today's Pravets, Botevgrad, Varshets, direction Vratsa), but belongs to the end of the third century to Thrace. Only in the last years of the 3rd century was the ridge considered a permanent and final border for the following centuries.

"With this reform, however, the territories of Nicopolis ad Istrum and Marcianopolis were transferred to Lower Moesia, which had previously belonged to the Roman province of Thrace for about two centuries." 110, and Marcianopolis - most probably under Hadrian (117-138).

Page 8 - Montana is marked as a Municipium. This is hardly the case.

In the article by M. Manov and M. Markov about a newly discovered monument to a decurio(n) from Montana (Manov, Markov 2016: 179–188) - the article is placed on the wrong basis. This is not a decurio of a municipium. Rather, it is the position of a person from a lower-ranking settlement (for details, see: K. Stoev. On the military-administrative history of Montana in the Roman era (I - III century). - In: From Montana to Montana : a City between Antiquity and the Present Reports from the scientific conference dedicated to the development of the city of Montana and the region over the centuries, held on June 17, 2016. Sofia, 2016, 34–51, Ivanov, R. Was Montana a municipality? - In: Between the Danube and the Balkans I - VI century Sofia 2017: 7-29 (IVRAY Publishing House) There are similar cases like this from other places.

"This rule is especially true for the municipalities of Montanenzium and Abritus, which, despite their distance from the main military centers on Istros, are an important component for the defense of the province. They house military units, dictating the way of development of the surrounding population, which resembles the features of the so-called "Limes Koine". In our opinion, Montana hardly played the role of the Second Limes. This place is the most economically important in the province of Lower Moesia. Valuable ores are found and gold is mined in the nearby rivers Ogosta and Zlatitsa.

Therefore, there are housed vexillationes of the First Italian and Eleventh Claudian Legion (sometimes separately, other times together), as well as auxiliary units, all attested by epigraphic way. - Melta - Nicopolis ad Istrum - Abritus - Marcianopolis. These settlements belong to Lower Moesia and Thrace, and Melta and Nicopolis ad Istrum are not military centers. I do not agree with this statement of theirs.

Perhaps the text should have commented on the stone pillars of Marcus Antius Rufinus.

These are the same stones with the same text. The inscriptions read as follows: M (arcus) Anti / us Rufinus inter / Thrac (as) et Moe / sos fines posuit. There are 11 of them, 5 of which were found between Roman station and the village of Staro Selo. Undoubtedly there was the workshop where they were made. The others are from the Veliko Tarnovo villages of Maslarevo, Polski Senovets, Hotnitsa, Emporium Piritensium (between Butovo and Nedan), Svishtov and Novae. Recently, a version of the Polish epigraph Jerzy Kolendo has been published, which has many supporters. It is not about border provincial pillars, but about the border between the Moesi and the Thracians. This happened in 136 under the command of Mark Antsiy Rufin (see Bozhilova, V., J. Kolendo.- Archeology 1985: 44; the first five were found by Ivan Hristov with his commentary and also by Nikolay Sharankov). The dissertation version would be important.

## **CHAPTER I:**

Written sources about the Thracians and the Roman provincial society (pp. 33-87) are very important with the ancient material collected on the topic and for the purposes of the work. The author shows his views, comments and analysis on the written sources, which are given in Greek and Latin (under the line).

In § 1. - for the ethno-demographic condition of the Thracians are commented as traditional for the region tribes Getae, the associated ethnonym Mizi, and more - Dacians, Tribals, Bessi, Scythians, Sarmatians, as well as Bastarns and Goths.

But the author's conclusion is that "In the territory between Istros and Hemus, in the descriptions of the ancient authors, the central place mentioned by the classical, Hellenistic and early imperial written tradition is tribals, ghettos and Mizi." (p.68).

In § 2. - the socio-economic characteristics of the Thracians are commented: the importance of the strong Getae state of Burebista; the role of the priestly institution in the demons related to Vologez/Vologases;

The existence of strategies as a legacy of dynastic homes in places, but not as a form of government that is considered to be transformed into a civitate of peregrine municipalities; the role of cities, but also of markets / emporia, road stations (stationes, mutationes) and villas (villae) for the socio-economic manifestation of the Thracians, who were early included in the Roman Empire. The villas are the basis of agriculture in Roman Thrace and Moesia. In fact, the Romans did not comply at all with local traditions and management methods. With the beginning of the urbanization at Trajan-Hadrian and after that, it can be seen that the strategies are being erased in order to be given to the territories of the new settlements. Until recently, it was thought that Roman cities were built on the existing Thracian, but this is hardly the case. This is shown by the latest archaeological excavations in Serdica and Pautalia, in Nicopolis ad Istrum and Novae (in the lowest layers there is no earlier Thracian evidence).

## **CHAPTER II:**

Epigraphic information about the Thracians and the Roman provincial society from the Black Sea coast between Istros and Haemus (88-229 p.) Has 4 real paragraphs: II.1. Persons of Thracian (and probably Thracian 1.2) origin among the military structures; II.2. Persons of Thracian (and probable Thracian 2.2) origin among the civil and administrative structures; II.3. Persons of Thracian (and probable Thracian 3.2) origin as a civil element in society; II.4. Persons of Thracian origin and presumably among non-free circles.

Historically, the Thracians came into contact earlier with the Greeks on the Black Sea polises and their urban territories. Gradually, they became part of the life of the cities on the Pontus - either through marriages, or by entering the priesthood and cultural and religious institutions. There is a visible preservation of their names, but also a stronger Hellenization. The region of Little Scythia is a border area and is important for its location - Black Sea in the east, Danube in the northwest, hinterland in the south. On the other hand, they also support the stabilization of this neuralgic region. Moreover, the official government is not indifferent to the Thracian villages (vici / komai) and partially makes them active in the Roman penetration among this Hellenic environment.

## **CHAPTER III:**

Epigraphic information about the Thracians and the Roman provincial society from the military centers along the Lower Danube Limes and the northern part of the territory between Istros and Haemus (230-328 p.). Has 3 real paragraphs: III.1. Persons of Thracian (and probably Thracian 1.2) origin among military structures; III.2. Persons of Thracian (and probable Thracian 2.2) origin among the civil and administrative structures; III.3. Persons of Thracian

#### CHAPTER IV:

Epigraphic information about the Thracians and the Roman provincial society from the southern Pristina mountainous part of the territory between Istros and Hemus (329-442 p.) Has 4 real paragraphs: IV.1. Persons of Thracian (and probably Thracian 1.2) origin among the military structures; IV.2. Persons of Thracian (and probable Thracian 2.2) origin among the civil and administrative structures; IV.3. Persons of Thracian (and probable Thracian 3.2) origin as a civil element in society; IV.4. Persons of Thracian origin and presumably among non-free circles.nd probable Thracian 3.2) origin as a civil element in society.

The dissertation is based on written sources and epigraphic monuments. I would also use archaeological data. An important source of information are, for example, the numerous Thracian sanctuaries from the Roman era in present-day Bulgaria, including between the Danube and the Balkan Mountains. Some of them have written artifacts, while others do not. Many conclusions could be drawn, unless it was decided not to address this issue in the topic of the dissertation.

#### CONCLUSION (443-459 p.):

In this dissertation, statistics are paramount.

Chapter Two: The inscriptions with names of persons of certain Thracian origin are 88, and of those with probable - 54, a total of 142; Chapter Three: The inscriptions with the names of persons of certain Thracian origin are 89, and of those with probable - 7, a total of 96, as 101 men are of the first type and 6 - of the second. The statistical and analytical conclusions are here: over 1/3 of the reported are related to the army corps or present as former military; another 1/3 - turn out to be connected to the auxiliary parts (auxilia Romana), which shows that the Thracians are relied on as an important factor in the area, which through the military successfully joins the provinces; this happens as Thracians, except in ordinary military recruitment (most massively), actively participate in the cavalry (alae) and navy (classis

Romana), reaching even to prestigious officer ranks; Despite the advanced Romanism (seen in the "Roman" Thracians) and despite the "Limes" region, this is a manifestation of a small part of the local population, because most (56.2%) of the reported Peregrines, ordinary Thracians from this region, use Thracian names. , maintaining its conservatism in the countryside;

Chapter Four: In this case, the names of 145 men and 19 women were derived from 121 inscriptions with secure Thracians, and 19 and 3, respectively, from the presumed ones. They give grounds for the following contribution conclusions: here, too, the manifestations are similar to those of the "Limes" society, with a definite active role of the cities of Nicopolis ad Istrum and Marcianopolis in the development of the Roman army and the distance of part of the population from the Thracian; Thus, it turns out that 32.9% of the persons of Thracian origin transform their name system under the influence of the Romanization strata and the a some reach the prestigious Praetorian Guard and the emperor's personal cavalry; others manage to develop into administrative positions and civilian positions as members of the decurion staff of a city such as Nicopolis ad Istrum, for example, or some other settlement; on the third hand - 55.4% of the safe Thracians (men and women) keep their names; the peculiarity of the Roman policy to rely on the Thracian village as a reserve for the participation of Thracians in the legions and auxiliary units is also observed; It is noteworthy that about 40% of the studied names managed to develop in the religious-priestly institution, retaining entirely their Thracian names.

The information of the ancient authors and the information provided by them about the directions of the dissertation. It turns out that the information is a bit insufficient in outlining a clear picture of the issue, which is why the epigraphic monuments from the lands between the Danube and the Balkans were used: in Chapter One - 139 inscriptions, in Chapter II - 96 and in Chapter Three - 121, the total impressive amount of 356 inscriptions on stone. The combined approach of examining written sources and epigraphic monuments, through the use of the research methods *interpretatione Graeca et Latina* and *interpretatione Thracica*, leads quite reasonably to important conclusions.

On the one hand, they show that this part of the Thracian lands, like other parts of the Roman Empire, purposefully and methodically became a real and active part of Pax Romana. If in the first century Rome's policy was to subdue the population, then from the middle of the second century the emphasis was on joint organization. It came to the point that through the army the Thracians held extremely prestigious leadership positions in the highest echelons of the



empire; they also have a well-visible presence, both in the administrative and civil institutions, as well as in the priestly colleges and the cult-religious institutions.

On the other hand, it is clear that for the most part the Thracian village remains conservative, preserving its name system and traditions. Eventually, albeit to varying degrees, there was a gradual integration of the population into Pax Romana, well represented in the epigraphic information.

"The extent of the assimilation processes cannot be confirmed, as in the time of the Antonines and the Severian it was seen that the Thracian name existed actively in the lands between Istros and Haemus, as judging by the inscriptions found. The number suggests a steady flow of Thracians from the villages, especially those from the west and southwest of the area, participating as recruits in the Roman army. These data give reason to understand that the Thracian village in the interior regions appears as a stable recruitment zone, which provides reliable personnel in the military units of Rome. "

We know from Aristotle that polises and roads make Civilization. This also applies to the topic area. The dissertation analyzes and comments as follows: "For the first time, the importance of the road arteries for the inclusion of some outskirts between Istros and Hemus is brought to the forefront and on display. In this respect, the lands of the future Little Scythia are distinguished, as well as those to the west, along the valley of the river Iskar, where the Roman character is represented in the funerary art. "

In the Conclusion of his work *Land tenure in Roman Thrace and Moesia (I-III century)*. - GSU FKNF, 72, 2, 1980, 3-173 Prof. Boris Gerov expresses his opinion that against the background of the other Roman provinces here our territory is one of the most backward in the Empire. The village remains somewhat conservative. Monetary relations reached their apogee only in the North, while elsewhere it happened in the Antonines. It was then that the economic boom in these territories began. It should not be forgotten that throughout the first century there were no cities in this area (this does not include the Greek colonies on the Pontus Euxinus, which seem to have a slightly different development), and tribal civitates / kivitates were initially documented. Later, from Trajan onwards, the settlements with the rank of municipality and colony were counted on the fingers. It seems that most of the conclusions of the dissertation, and especially on the basis of the rich statistics applied throughout the work, these works are confirmed. An analysis of these 356 Greek and Latin inscriptions found between Danubius and Hemus Mons proves to some extent these judgments, but also shows

more clearly and distinctly the gradual and growing role of the Thracians in provincial life and even in places managerial positions in the north-east. The Balkans through the Principate.

**Minor notes:**

At the end of the dissertation ADDENDA should be placed on the numerous written sources, not at the beginning (proposal of Assoc. Prof. Il. Boyanov)

The main participants in the corps for the Thracian Horseman (CCET) and Jupiter Dolichen (CCID) had to be mentioned. These are Prof. Zlatozara Gocheva, Prof. Manfred Oppermann (Published in the Netherlands) and Associate Professor. Varbinka Naydenova (ANRW - Berlin - New York).

In ancient sources it should be noted which edition is used, the year, who are the publishers and translators; This creates a more complete scientific completeness.

You have to find and use the book by Alexandru Suceveanu from 1973 (Bucharest) about Scythia Minor. It is written in Romanian, but with an extensive French summary. It is very useful for the life, economy, ethnic composition and religious beliefs of the population in this area.

The article about found dedications to beneficiaries was not written by Teofil Ivanov, but by Rumen Ivanov. (Ivanov, T. 1993: 26–30) .- pp.20-21.

Dioinysopolis is written this way - p.40. , the surname is Makrya, not Makrea, because in Romanian "ea" is pronounced "ya" - p.38.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY USED**

It is impressive, as the titles in Latin are much more than those in Cyrillic, 421 and 168, respectively - a total of 589.

The abstract meets the requirements, I confirm the 10 contributions listed in it; the publications on the topic of the dissertation are sufficient in number - 4, of which 1 is in print.

No plagiarism was noticed in the dissertation.

**CONCLUSION:**

**All of the above and the important scientific contributions I have given give me reason to give a positive assessment of the award of ONS Doctor, in PN 2.2 History and Archeology, majoring in Ancient History and Thracology, to Stefan Yanakiev for his dissertation The Thracians and the Roman Provincial Society between Istros and Hemus in the I - III century Sofia, 2021. \***

August 23, 2021

Prof. Rumen Teofilov Ivanov

• I thank my colleague Prof. K. Porojanov, who sent me a sample for writing the review according to the requirements of the Institute of Balkan Studies with a center in Thracology.